| 1  |  |
|----|--|
| 2  |  |
| 3  | COUNTY OF MAUI, STATE OF HAWAII                      |
| 4  |  |
| 5  |  |
| 6  |  |
| 7  | MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE MAUI POLICE COMMISSION |
| 8  | NOVEMBER 18, 2020 AT 2:04 P.M.                       |
| 9  | MAUI POLICE DEPARTMENT                               |
| 10 | VIA BLUEJEANS  |
| 11 | REGULAR MEETING                                      |
| 12 |  |
| 13 |  |
| 14 |  |
| 15 |  |
| 16 |  |
| 17 |  |
| 18 |  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 | REPORTED BY: SANDRA J. GRAN, RPR/CSR #424            |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 |  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |

| 1  | APPEARANCES                               |
|----|---|
| 2  | COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:               |
| 3  | Frank De Rego, Jr., Chair                 |
| 4  | Roberta Patnode, Vice Chair               |
| 5  | Janet Kuwahara                            |
| 6  | Randol Leach                              |
| 7  | Mark Redeker                              |
| 8  | Eugene Santiago                           |
| 9  |   |
| 10 | STAFF PRESENT:                            |
| 11 | Deputy Chief Dean Rickard                 |
| 12 | Melissa Magonigle, Business Administrator |
| 13 | Gary Murai, Deputy Corporation Counsel    |
| 14 | Amy Lau, Commission Secretary             |
| 15 |   |
| 16 |   |
| 17 |   |
| 18 |   |
| 19 |   |
| 20 |   |
| 21 |   |
| 22 |   |
| 23 |   |
| 24 |   |
| 25 |   |

3

| 1  | (NOVEMBER 18, 2020, 2:04 P.M.)                               |
|----|--|
| 2  | * * *  |
| 3  | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. We'll call the meeting of the           |
| 4  | Maui Police Commission to order. It's now 2:04 p.m. We'll    |
| 5  | have roll call. Commissioner Redeker.                        |
| 6  | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Here.                                  |
| 7  | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Leach.                           |
| 8  | COMMISSIONER LEACH: Here.                                    |
| 9  | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Santiago.                        |
| 10 | COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: Here.                                 |
| 11 | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Patnode.                         |
| 12 | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Here.                                    |
| 13 | CHAIR DE REGO: Oh, I'm sorry, I'm missing my list.           |
| 14 | God, I feel terrible. Okay. Commissioner Sharen is excused.  |
| 15 | Commissioner Kawamura is trying to get in, so and let's      |
| 16 | see. And then I'm here, so I'm sorry. Today I'm a little     |
| 17 | disheveled. And we've been got one Jen.                      |
| 18 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: Hi.                                   |
| 19 | MS. LAU: Chair, I don't see Commissioner Mano.               |
| 20 | MR. MURAI: Chair, I think you're muted.                      |
| 21 | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Frank, we can't hear you.                |
| 22 | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Mano, we'll mark him as          |
| 23 | excused. Okay. So that's it. We have quorum.                 |
| 24 | Let's see. Oral or written testimony on move to              |
| 25 | oral or written testimony. Do we have any written testimony, |

1 Amy?

2.0

2.4

MS. LAU: Yes. The commissioners were emailed that.

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. And that was from Quieter &

Healthier Hawaii -- Maui; correct?

MS. LAU: Correct.

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. We've received that testimony. Since it's not on the agenda today, what we're gonna do is file that testimony and then move -- pass it on to the chief. Just a word about testimony to everyone here who's not a part of the commission or the department, all testimony must be related to items on the agenda and the police commission has very limited jurisdiction, okay, in terms of what it can discuss on its agenda.

Basically, the commission can hire, fire, and evaluate the police chief; we submit and review the -- the department's budget, and last but not least, we take in specific complaints about misconduct that are filed with the department secretary and that are brought before the department. Those are the three functions of the police commission.

As -- first is operations, anything that touches on operations in the department, we usually take those correspondence or that testimony and move it on to the police chief, whose jurisdiction is to look that over. I know for -- my experience so far has been he's very good at responding to

1 those -- directly to those involved in those kinds of 2 situations. So we're going to take that written testimony, 3 we'll file it and pass it on to the police chief. 4 Is there anyone here who has any testimony on any of the agenda items on the commission's agenda? 5 If you don't 6 have it, it's available online. Specifically related to what 7 we're dealing with today. 8 (No response.) 9 If you could let Amy know in chat if CHAIR DE REGO: 10 you want to testify or you could let us know now if you're on 11 the phone. 12 (No response.) 13 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Hearing none, I, without objection, will close public testimony today. 14 15 We'll move on to correspondence. We received PC 16 20-15, Honolulu Police Commission 2019 Annual Report. Do I 17 hear a motion to file the report? Or let me do it this way: 18 Without objection, let's file that report. 19 (No response.) 2.0 CHAIR DE REGO: Hearing none, we will file that 21 report and correspondence. 22 Commissioner Redeker, so you have an objection. 23 COMMISSIONER REDEKER: No. I'm looking at the -- at 2.4 the agenda. 25 CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER REDEKER: I think we missed the 1 2 approval of the minutes. 3 CHAIR DE REGO: Oh, the minutes. I'm sorry. Excuse 4 So you have the agendas, I think that that has me. 5 been -- I mean, the minutes before you. Do I hear a motion to 6 approve the minutes of the regular meeting of October 21st? 7 Commissioner Redeker, could you make that a voice --8 COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Yes. I move to approve of 9 the regular minutes of October 21st. 10 CHAIR DE REGO: Do I have a second? 11 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: (Gesturing.) 12 CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Kawamura, I saw your hands first, so there's a second, Commissioner Kawamura. All 13 in -- okay. I have to take a -- roll call votes on these. 14 15 So I'm gonna go down the line. Vice Chair Patnode? Okay? 16 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Aye. CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Redeker. 17 18 COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Ave. 19 CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Leach. 2.0 COMMISSIONER LEACH: Aye. 21 CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Santiago. 22 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: 23 CHAIR DE REGO: And Commissioner Kawamura. 2.4 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: It's Kuwahara. 25 CHAIR DE REGO: Kuwahara. Oh, God. I am sorry.

Gees. 1 2 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: Aye. 3 CHAIR DE REGO: I'm going from memory. Good. 4 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: I thought we had somebody 5 new. 6 Thank you for the correction. CHAIR DE REGO: 7 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: I thought we got somebody 8 new. 9 CHAIR DE REGO: Kuwahara, Kuwahara. I am sorry. So 10 there we go. I forgot my list when I was getting all of my papers together, so I'm still learning people's names. 11 12 can't wait until I meet all of you in person, simply because 13 it's easier for me when I see somebody physically to remember 14 their name, but now you're getting me relying on my memory, 15 which is not very good. 16 Okay. So --MR. MURAI: Chair. 17 CHAIR DE REGO: My apologies. 18 19 Chair, it's on our letterhead. MR. MURAI: 2.0 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 21 If you ever need, it's on our MR. MURAI: 22 letterhead. 23 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. There we go. I will have to 24 get some letterhead, because it's -- I'm going to ask Amy to 25 put it on our agendas now, so I -- so I have something I can

1 look at directly. 2 So thank you, Commissioner Kuwahara, for the 3 correction and my apologies. Good. 4 So all in favor? I mean, I say aye, so the meeting 5 regular minutes are passed. 6 Let's move on -- I have a suggestion for 6, Okay. 7 7, and 8, since we all received the packets involved in this 8 and we're gonna have an extended presentation on the budget by 9 Melissa, without objection, I would ask if anybody has any 10 questions for the chief or for the current financial report 11 and budget expenditures or the personnel report, promotions, reallocations, terminations, and work assignments, that they 12 13 would ask those now on any three of those, if that's not irregular. 14 15 So Commissioner Leach. Yes. COMMISSIONER LEACH: Yes, I have a -- one question. 16 I guess the sergeant's filling in for the chief today; is that 17 18 correct? SERGEANT McCUTCHEON: No, I'm just -- I'm just 19 20 attending. 21 COMMISSIONER LEACH: Oh, okay. 22 SERGEANT McCUTCHEON: I'm just viewing. I believe 23 Chief Rickard is there. 2.4 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Yes, I'm here. 25 COMMISSIONER LEACH: Oh, I don't see his -- his

mugshot. Oh, okay. There he is.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: I'm here.

COMMISSIONER LEACH: Hi, Dean. I have a question.

I saw in the media there was some talk about confidentiality in disciplining officers, that their names should be given to the public, what -- where are we on that and what is our policy?

CHAIR DE REGO: You're muted, Chief.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Yeah. Commissioner Leach, it's a new law, Act 285 that went into effect as of July 1st and what it requires is it requires -- the annual report was always submitted in years past with regards to any type of discipline within the departments, would have to be reported to the legislature. However, this time around, the law includes the releasing of the officers' names, which is something that has been unprecedented in the past and something that I know SHOPO has been in opposition to. And, you know, since we do have Sergeant McCutcheon, who is the chapter chair for Maui, you know, if he'd like to, he can chime in, if you folks want to ask him a question with regards to how SHOPO is addressing the issues, so --

I know that our report isn't completed yet. We're required to report it every year in January, Melissa usually takes care of it. Right now we're not really concerned about it because we have until January to submit it, so we're

1 worrying about just completing the budget, then we'll work on 2 our report to the legislature with that disciplinary actions 3 report, so -- but for now, I believe SHOPO has filed an 4 injunction with Kauai Police Department and I believe the 5 Honolulu Police Department, if I'm not mistaken, because they 6 had already released their reports. Right now, we haven't 7 released anything yet and we'll be doing so in line with the 8 new law. 9 COMMISSIONER LEACH: Thank you. So the report would 10 be an annual basis, not --Yeah, the report -- there's 11 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: 12 an annual report, however, an individual through IUPA or OIA 13 can request information at any time and they -- we're 14 obligated to respond. That's where we're at right now. Thank you. 15 COMMISSIONER LEACH: CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Redeker. 16 17 COMMISSIONER REDEKER: On the same lines, the report 18 goes to the legislature, we in the police commission have 19 never seen that, so I'm assuming it never went to us. Well, I don't control where 20 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: 21 the reports go other than we're required to submit it to the 22 legislature and if it wasn't coming to you folks, then maybe 23 that's something that we can discuss with Amy to make sure

COMMISSIONER REDEKER:

that you folks do get it.

2.4

25

Okay.

DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: 'Cause it's open to the 1 2 It's not confidential, it's available to the public public. 3 when it's put out to the legislature. 4 COMMISSIONER REDEKER: So this is -- so this report 5 you turn in is a recap of the entire year? 6 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Correct. 7 COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Okay. 8 CHAIR DE REGO: And what's the status of the 9 injunction, the application for the injunction at this point, 10 Chief? 11 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: I'm -- maybe Sergeant 12 McCutcheon, do you have any comment on where the injunction is 13 right now with the statewide SHOPO. So right now the statewide 14 SERGEANT McCUTCHEON: 15 SHOPO, chief was correct with regards to Kauai and -- and 16 Honolulu. Reason being that they filed the injunction was 17 that it was just really quick how it -- how it went through 18 the process and the SHOPO stance on it is just, basically, we 19 understand the discipline record, it's the individual's names 2.0 that are being released which SHOPO wants to kind of keep that 21 from the public, in a sense. Because what happens is there's 22 a trickle effect to the families and stuff. Smaller 23 departments will be affected a lot more than the larger ones, 2.4 I believe, because the officers are more personal to the

25

community.

So as of right now, Maui hasn't -- Maui Chapter hasn't filed anything. Like chief said, they haven't given their report yet. There was one officer's name that I believe Maui Beat or something requested information for and that was released a couple weeks ago, but that was the only one with the name that was actually sent out. As for the entire report, nothing -- nothing yet. And I believe Maui would probably follow suit, the Maui Chapter would follow suit with regards to the injunction. And, again, it's not against the -- really against the department, it's more of wanting to see if SHOPO as a union would have a -- at least a testimony period to kind of discuss their feelings on how it's gonna affect the officers and the officers' families if you release the names opposed to just the disciplinary record.

And I understand transparency and the union does as well and like we say at the union, we're not trying to protect the bad apples, it's just the contract and -- and just the working relationship. We don't want a disciplinary record that later on three years down the road gets overturned, no one's gonna hear about that later. They're not gonna hear about the overturn, they'll only hear about what -- what was bad, you know, and that sticks, you know. So that's pretty much on the -- on the union side right now. And I believe all four counties will follow suit with Kauai and Honolulu once Hawaii PD has to release theirs and Maui releases theirs as

| 1  | well.   |
|----|---|
| 2  | CHAIR DE REGO: Thank you, Sergeant.                           |
| 3  | Any other questions?  |
| 4  | (No response.)  |
| 5  | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Anything on the personnel                |
| 6  | reports, recruitment, promotions, reallocation, terminations, |
| 7  | and work assignments? Any questions on those or any           |
| 8  | questions? Commissioner Redeker.                              |
| 9  | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Yeah. On the personnel                  |
| 10 | report, what's our total number of reserves at this point in  |
| 11 | time?   |
| 12 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: When you say "reserves," you            |
| 13 | mean reserve officers?  |
| 14 | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Yes.                                    |
| 15 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: We don't have reserve                   |
| 16 | officers. We have auxiliary officers and I believe we have    |
| 17 | four.   |
| 18 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay.  |
| 19 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: We have if you're talk                  |
| 20 | are you talking about police reserve officers?                |
| 21 | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Yes.                                    |
| 22 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: That's four.                            |
| 23 | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Four.                                   |
| 24 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: That's four.                            |
| 25 | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Four. Okay.                             |

| 1  | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: We have four.                            |
|----|--|
| 2  | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Thank you.                               |
| 3  | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Was there a number                       |
| 4  | specifically that you were reported about?                     |
| 5  | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: No, no. I just I had                     |
| 6  | heard there were there were seven now, so I                    |
| 7  | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: I'm not the one that swears              |
| 8  | them in, so and I'm filling in for the chief, so I             |
| 9  | believe I know of four, I don't know the other three. I        |
| 10 | could double-check and maybe Melissa Melissa, are you          |
| 11 | on?  |
| 12 | CHAIR DE REGO: Yes, she is.                                    |
| 13 | MS. MAGONIGLE: Yes, I'm on. I don't have the exact             |
| 14 | number. I can follow up, though.                               |
| 15 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Yeah, so I know there have               |
| 16 | been others that have put in, whether they were sworn in as of |
| 17 | yet, I'm not too sure. Chief is the one that takes care of     |
| 18 | that, so   |
| 19 | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Thank you.                               |
| 20 | DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Okay.                                    |
| 21 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. And any questions on the                  |
| 22 | current financial report and budget expenditures? I'm kind of  |
| 23 | skipping around here while we're taking this as a group, so    |
| 24 | any questions on that?   |
| 25 | (No response.)   |

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Hearing none, thank you, 1 2 Chief. Thank you, Sergeant McCutcheon. We're gonna -- I 3 think you're gonna -- I hope you're gonna stick around for the 4 presentation on the budget, Chief. 5 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: Yeah, I'll be here. 6 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 7 DEPUTY CHIEF RICKARD: I'm gonna be turning it over to Melissa to --8 9 CHAIR DE REGO: Melissa. Okay. Thank you very 10 much. 11 So now we'll have the Maui Police Department FY '22 12 proposed budget presentation and review. We have Melissa 13 Magonigle from the department who has graciously consented to 14 give us a full presentation on the budget. You sent us a lot 15 of material, very interesting, by the way. Okay. So take it 16 away. 17 MS. MAGONIGLE: Okay. So jumping to the FY '22 18 budget, so that'll begin July 1st of 2021 and it runs through June 30th of 2022. So just to go over -- it's pretty much 19 2.0 broken down into three main areas. I think that got sent out 21 to you. I tried to --22 CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah. 23 MS. MAGONIGLE: -- break it all down. So there's 24 gonna to be three different accounts. There's the A account, 25 which is salary and wages, premium pay, expansion positions;

1 there's the B account, which is operating expenses; and then 2 there's the C account, which is equipment, which includes 3 vehicles. So the C account, the difference is it's items that 4 are over a thousand dollars each. So if you have an item 5 that's \$950, that'll fall into the B account. So that's kind 6 of the breakdown. So as I go through the budget, I'm going to 7 be breaking it down into A account, B account, and C account, so the three different areas. 8 9 CHAIR DE REGO: So we should be looking at the 10 budget narrative, then, that document you sent to us, got sent 11 to us, or which document? 12 MS. MAGONIGLE: That one -- yeah. Sorry. I was 13 gonna go over the other one, what we are planning to request 14 or what we are requesting --15 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. -- for the FY '22. 16 MS. MAGONIGLE: So I'll go over 17 the personnel that we'll be requesting, the amount, the 18 operating expenses, and then the --19 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 2.0 MS. MAGONIGLE: Yeah. And the budget narrative, the 21 big change is the performance measures. 22 CHAIR DE REGO: Right. 23 MS. MAGONIGLE: So that was updated in the budget 2.4 narrative. 25 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Thank you.

MS. MAGONIGLE: You're welcome.

2.0

2.4

So the way the process goes is we start with what we call prebudget meetings, so each of the bureaus -- well, basically, each of the commanders will submit a to/from. So they pretty much put together their wish list, what they think their -- would be most efficient for their section or their district. So they'll submit a memo, a to/from to their assistant chief with what positions they require, what equipment, what operating expenses they would like. Those to/froms get submitted to their assistant chief, that gets put together and during the prebudget meetings is when the commanders present their budget to the chief and the deputy chief.

So we had our prebudget meetings. We had the Investigative Services Bureau done on October 5th, Support Services Bureau done on October 6th, and Uniformed Services Bureau on October 7th, so that's when we had the prebudget meetings. And I believe, yeah, Mr. De Rego, Chair, that you were on a few of them. Yeah. So that's where we -- that's kind of the meat and potatoes of the budget process. We really hear directly from the commanders what it is that they would like, what they need, and, most importantly, the justification, why they need that position, why they need that piece of equipment.

So they get -- they submit that, I'll take all that

2.0

information from the commanders and I roll it up and I put it together and I present it to the -- their assistant chief.

The assistant chief of the bureau will then prioritize what they think is the most important for the personnel request or the equipment requests for their bureau. Once the assistant chief prioritizes it, it then goes to the chief and the deputy chief of police and they'll prioritize it on behalf of the entire department. So that's kind of the process that it is goes through.

So once I get the priority from the chief and the deputy chief, then I'll do the paperwork and then that's what we submit to the mayor's office based on the department's priority. So the budget was due on November 13th. So thank you, everyone, I came back from maternity leave November 1st, so sorry for the delay. I know next year we had discussions that we'll try to start the process a little earlier.

So going into the budget --

CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah, just to -- to echo that, yeah, because of the -- just a reminder, it's the commission that's supposed to review and submit the budget to the mayor, so -- that's what it says in the charter, so we're gonna have to push this timing of -- before it goes to the mayor back so it's actually the commission that's fulfilling its charter responsibility. That's all we're trying to do here, is kind of -- kind of set things out the way they're supposed to be

done in terms of our mandate. So, yeah, so we'll fix that up next time. We'll be sending a letter out in January to the -- to the department saying that they'll have to meet with us. If the mayor is asking for the budget by November, then you're gonna have to have the budget completed by October when you present it to us, so we can pass it on to the mayor. So that -- I just wanted to make that clear.

MS. MAGONIGLE: Yes, understood.

CHAIR DE REGO: So we can dig into the numbers.

MS. MAGONIGLE: Okay.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Now for the breakdown for the A account. mentioned, the salaries and wages. The only difference with the A account is that -- contractual raises. So HGEA finalized their contract, so with MPD we have various units within HGEA, so we have Bargaining Unit 3, Bargaining Unit 4, and Bargaining Unit 13. So as you can see on the paperwork, there were step movements, so we had to increase the employees They got rid of Step B. for their step movements. a 3.4 percent across-the-board increase for Bargaining Unit 3 employees. For Bargaining Unit 4 employees, again, step movements, they deleted Step B. There was a 3.6 percent across-the-board increase July 1st, 2020, and then another 3.74 percent increase January 1st, 2021. We also have Bargaining Unit 13, so the continuation of step movements. There was a 2.15 percent across-the-board increase July 1st,

2019, and a 2.03 percent across-the-board increase July 1st, 2020.

2.4

So those were pretty much the big increases with salaries, is all four HGEA employees. There weren't any pay increases -- right now there's -- the contract for SHOPO doesn't have -- I don't think it's been completed yet or negotiated yet, so there were no increases for SHOPO for FY '22. So that takes care of the salaries.

For premium pay, last year our premium pay was cut by 25 percent in FY '21. We did not ask for an increase on that, so that's status quo, we kept it with -- with that cut for now. What we did do is we deleted last -- for FY '20 and FY '21, according to the Bargaining Unit 12, the SHOPO contract, all sworn personnel received lump-sum payments depending on what step they were on. So they all received lump-sum payments for '20, '21, now that we're in '22, we had to delete all those lump-sum payments. So that's the difference with -- with that one.

So the differences -- so the salaries and wages, we're -- the MPD is requesting an increase of \$776,525 to cover the HGEA contractual increases, but we're also deleting \$734 -- \$734,700 in the lump-sum payments. So the difference between those two is an increase of \$41,825, is what we're asking for in the salaries and wages, then.

Through the prebudget meetings -- like I said, the

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

commanders will go through and they'll submit what positions they think, you know, would be most beneficial for their district or their sections. Once we compiled everything, there were a total of 25 positions that were requested and that's from the entire department. That went forward to the chief and the deputy and of that, three positions were selected. And that's pretty much due -- I mean, the current state of the economy right now and also -- so three positions were selected out of the 25 and they're all nonsworn. So none of the sworn positions were selected and, like I said, only So the three, by priority, is an office operations assistant 2 and that's for the communications section, a police evidence custodian for Kihei Patrol, and a public safety aide for Molokai Patrol. So those are the three positions that we are submitting, we are requesting this year for the department and, again, they're all nonsworn positions.

So if you look at the -- what I submitted, there's a total annual cost, so it has their salary for the entire year. The second part of it is the eight months salary. So usually when we request in the budget, they allow four months for recruiting, for posting the position and recruiting. So when we ask for salary in the FY '22 budget, we're only asking for eight months of salary, so that's kind of how -- like if you look at the -- the sheet I sent, it'll have the total salary and then there's another column that's saying eight months

salary and that's the reason why, is 'cause of the four months 1 2 that they factor in for recruiting. 3 So then if we go --4 CHAIR DE REGO: Can I ask -- can I ask --MS. MAGONIGLE: 5 Yes. 6 CHAIR DE REGO: -- ask a question here? 7 MS. MAGONIGLE: Sure. 8 CHAIR DE REGO: And people should feel free to ask 9 questions as she's going. I think that's the better way of 10 dealing with it instead of going through an hour of presentation or whatever, right. Ask as you feel. 11 12 So let me ask you a question about -- so these are 13 expansion positions, that's what you're saying? 14 MS. MAGONIGLE: Yes. 15 CHAIR DE REGO: In terms of -- okay. So I'm a neophyte here, so other people might know this and I don't. 16 17 Is -- okay. So the police force is at, what, about 80 percent 18 strength right now and I would imagine that there's 20 percent 19 of those positions left. Are those still open positions that 2.0 you can hire for that you account for in the budget or am I 21 reading that wrong in terms of how you budget for the force? 22 MS. MAGONIGLE: Yeah. No, that's correct. 23 are open positions that are available for people to apply for. 2.4 On the nonsworn side, a majority of those positions are 25 dispatch positions.

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 1 2 So a lot of the vacancies are -- are MS. MAGONIGLE: 3 pretty much the -- the dispatchers. 4 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Okav. 5 MS. MAGONIGLE: On the nonsworn side. 6 CHAIR DE REGO: And there's some -- because we 7 always get these reports about, you know, retention and 8 there's always these open positions, so those have already 9 been budgeted for even on the civilian side, the nonsworn side 10 that there's open positions that you can continually fill until you reach your quota, is that -- is that what's 11 12 happening? And there's a carryover at the end of the fiscal 13 year, is that what's going on? 14 MS. MAGONIGLE: Yes. If there's the vacancy for the 15 position, we do recruitments constantly. 16 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So we'll always -- if there's ever a 17 MS. MAGONIGLE: 18 vacant position, we'll -- we're recruiting for it. 19 position that's on continuous recruitment are the dispatcher 20 positions, that one we never -- we never close, it's on continuous. 21 22 CHAIR DE REGO: So an average, what's the carryover 23 for the department, just out of interest sake, every year just 2.4 based on labor? 25 MS. MAGONIGLE: I'd say it's about 3 million. I can

1 give you an exact number where it closed out on the last 2 Fiscal Year '20. 3 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Thank you. 4 MS. MAGONIGLE: But that would include sworn, sworn 5 positions as well. 6 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Thank you very much. 7 MS. MAGONIGLE: Okay. You're welcome. 8 So that was pretty much everything for the -- what 9 we call the A account, the salaries and wages. The next one 10 is gonna be what we call the B account, the operating expenses. So, again, all the commanders will submit 11 12 everything that they need, whether it's office chairs, desks, 13 an increase in professional services. In the report that I 14 sent to you, I pretty much just outlined the larger request 15 items. So for the department total in the operating 16 expenses, we'll be requesting an increase of \$721,018. So the 17 18 large amounts on there: 19 For the Investigative Services Bureau, there's a 2.0 \$100,000 increase for professional services and that has to do 21 with our autopsies. So that, of course, we don't know what 22 that amount is gonna be, but we've gone over budget pretty 23 much the past two years. 2.4 Also for the Support Services Bureau, the large 25 amounts, 200,000 for motor pool repairs and maintenance. As

you'll see on our vehicles, a lot of the vehicles are, you know, a hundred thousand miles, so, naturally, with that kind of mileage, it requires additional repairs and maintenance to keep it up to standard.

2.4

\$180,000 to utility and that's for repairs and maintenance consultations and that's for the Wailuku Station and Lahaina Station.

150,000 for the radio shop repairs and maintenance and that's based on historical. So, basically, the last two years they've gone over budget, so we want to kind of bring it up to where we match what they've been spending.

\$60,000 for body armor and, again, that's just rotational based on the warranty.

And then we also have another \$24,000 for Police One Academy. So this is a software system we've been using more for training now with COVID-19, so we have some money in there.

So those are the more big-ticket items in operating expenses that we -- that we're requesting.

And then -- so that concludes the B account, the operating expenses. The rest in operating expenses, some of the other items, it includes electricity, water, janitorial services, towing charges, so it's just the expenses that the department needs to function. But, like I said, I kind of just highlighted the -- the big-ticket items that we're

requesting increases in.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

For the C account, which is our equipment account, we're -- as I mentioned, each piece of equipment is over a thousand dollars. So, again, the commanders submit what they need, the assistant chiefs prioritize, and then the chief and deputy will prioritize for the department. Basically, the goal is -- the prioritization, the most important on the priority list, of course, is officer safety, so that's usually what gets prioritized first. So there were 21 items that we're going to be submitting for. And by department priority, I'll read them down the list. We have AEDs, tasers, portable radios, forensic drying cabinet filters, ballistic tactical vests and armor plates, a workstation and hutch -- I'm sorry, workstation with hutch and storage for Molokai Patrol. From what I've heard, that desk has been there for decades. ATVs for Kihei Patrol, that's to replace their ones that were purchased in 2006. Rifles and suppressors for the Special Two Harley David -- Davidson motorcycles for Response Team. the Traffic Section. And, again, that's rotational. All of these are replacement items. Well, the Molokai Patrol site is -- one is not, it's LRAD speaker. Kihei Patrol, a Polaris and, again, that's to replace a 2006 ATV. Carbon oxygen cylinder tanks for the vice section. A remote firing device for SRT and that's for the Hawaii -- the bomb squad. Workstations for the Juvenile Section. Forensic light source

for the Forensic Unit, CID Forensic Unit. Digital camera for the Forensic Unit. Crime light for the Forensic Unit. Bolt-enhanced rifles for Molokai Patrol. Monster Lite fold back wall mount rack for Lahaina Patrol and training fitness equipment for Lahaina Patrol. It's for their weight room.

And then an arms band launcher for Molokai Patrol.

2.0

2.4

So all those items together, the total cost we're requesting is \$643,000 -- sorry, \$643,398 for equipment for the department.

Did anyone have any questions on that so far?

(No response.)

MS. MAGONIGLE: On the other part of the equipment, we will be -- we are requesting 75 vehicles in FY '22. And so what I sent, it has the breakdown of how many marked, how many unmarked, and four-wheel drive, etc. So our rural districts, they require four-wheel drive, our Hana and Molokai and then also the Vice, the K9 Section, they require four-wheel drive. So it has the breakdown of the different units and where they will be going. All the request is made by mileage. So on what -- the spreadsheet that was sent, it's sorted by mileage and that's what we -- that's our -- based on our rotational policy. So as we replace, it depends whether they're a marked unit, unmarked unit, and then the mileage on the vehicle, of course. And this mileage that's on here, that's the mileage from months ago, from when we had the prebudget meeting, so by

1 the time we actually get the money July 1st, obviously, the 2 mileage is going to be a lot higher than what's listed here. 3 And just so you know, so this year we're requesting 4 75 vehicles. In FY '20, we requested 104 vehicles, 25 were 5 In FY '21, we requested 108 vehicles and 57 were approved. 6 approved. And we also requested a trike and two motorcycles 7 in FY '21, so that was -- we also got. So this year we're 8 doing 75 vehicles and two motorcycles, so we're hoping that, 9 you know, we get a large -- or a decent amount this year as 10 well to replace the vehicles. 11 And that's all I have for the budget presentation. 12 So that went over the A account, the salaries and wages; the 13 operating expenses in the B account; and then equipment and vehicles in the C account. 14 15 I'm open to any questions if anyone has any. That's all I have, Chair. 16 17 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Thank you. MS. MAGONIGLE: 18 Yes. CHAIR DE REGO: 19 Any questions from the commission? 2.0 (No response.) 21 MS. MAGONIGLE: Okay. Thank you. 22 I -- of course, I always have CHAIR DE REGO: 23 questions; right? They found that out when I was sitting in 2.4 on the budget and I even had some suggestions. So just one 25 question: Are there any budget assumptions built into this

| 1  | about possible cuts? In other words, have you guys already     |
|----|--|
| 2  | kind of prioritized and no need to say this in public,         |
| 3  | right, but, you know, do you work off budget assumptions where |
| 4  | you prioritize some of these requests just in case the council |
| 5  | comes back like it did last year? I follow all the budget      |
| 6  | hearings, by the way, because the place I work for, we're also |
| 7  | monitoring our own grants, so I'm you know, I kind of          |
| 8  | follow what's going on in police and fire and everything else, |
| 9  | just watching the budget hearings. That there's always a       |
| 10 | question, are there any budget assumptions that go into this   |
| 11 | about what the fiscal year of the next year might look like in |
| 12 | terms of the county budget as a whole and have you kind of     |
| 13 | or does that happen on a on a "We'll make the decision if      |
| 14 | they ask us to cut" basis?                                     |
| 15 | MS. MAGONIGLE: So with the the equipment and the               |
| 16 | personnel so, basically, it's prioritized as                   |
| 17 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay.   |
| 18 | MS. MAGONIGLE: you had mentioned, so right                     |
| 19 | away usually they'll cut and they'll cut the bottom, you       |
| 20 | know   |
| 21 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay.   |
| 22 | MS. MAGONIGLE: depending on how much they want                 |
| 23 | to cut. So when we submit it, we have it prioritized already.  |
| 24 | CHAIR DE REGO: Oh, okay.                                       |
| 25 | MS. MAGONIGLE: So they'll usually cut however much             |

1 they need and they'll cut from the bottom. And they keep our 2 most important items left, depending on where they cut. last year we did wait for them to come to us, because we 3 4 weren't sure what percentage they needed us to cut as well. 5 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 6 MS. MAGONIGLE: So they had asked to cut 5 percent 7 of our entire budget and then that's when we went and 8 analyzed, you know, to see what we could cut. So we don't 9 know what percentage they're gonna ask for us to cut if we're 10 gonna have to cut, but we'll do it at that time. 11 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Thank you. Yeah, that makes 12 sense. Yeah. 13 Anybody else? I don't want to be the one that prolongs this. 14 15 (No response.) CHAIR DE REGO: Well, thank you, Melissa. 16 hear any other questions from the commission, but we 17 18 appreciate this. 19 Thank you, Chief, also for being here. We -- next 2.0 year we'll work on the process, as I said before, and we'll 21 kind of make everything all, as they say in California, 22 copacetic with the charter. Okay? So mahalo and thank you 23 very much for your presentation. 2.4 MS. MAGONIGLE: Okay. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, 25 Commission Members.

CHAIR DE REGO: Take care. Mahalo. 1 2 Good. So let's move on to Old Business. Okay. 3 Okay. Yeah. We created a TIG for the budget review. Ι'm 4 gonna -- since we're -- we had our budget review as a whole 5 right now, I'm gonna request that we disband the TIG and that 6 the commission authorize --7 I think, Gary, are you here? Oh, yes. 8 MR. MURAI: I am, Mr. Chair. 9 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Commissioner Patnode. 10 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Hi. This is Bobbie. I just wanted to say thank you, Frank, for making the point about the 11 12 budget is supposed to come from the commission and I think we've -- I have felt like we overlooked that in the past, so I 13 14 wanted to say thank you for that. And I didn't know if before 15 you disband, if there was a -- if you might want to just write 16 down what your recommendation is about the process that we 17 follow so that we make sure we do it next year. 18 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 19 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: That's all. 2.0 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So we're supposed to, in some 21 sense, review and submit. Unfortunately, as she's already 22 said, the budget's been submitted November 13th. But what we 23 can do is -- are you suggesting we do a -- we have -- send a 2.4 letter saying we've reviewed the budget and -- but that we

have concerns that we're not following the charter and -- is

25

that something that we'd like to do, to send to the mayor and 1 2 say that, you know, we're asking for a process change in that 3 regard so it meets up with the charter? I'm not quite sure. 4 Gary, can you help us with this in terms of wording 5 or whatever? 6 Is that what we're looking for? Commissioner --7 Vice Chair Patnode. I'm sorry. 8 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Actually, what I'm looking for, 9 Frank, is just something for the commission. 10 CHAIR DE REGO: Yes. 11 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: For our internal process. 12 don't know that we need to send anything to the mayor at this 13 point. 14 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 15 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I have absolute total faith in the work that Melissa does for us, she's excellent. I feel 16 17 we're very lucky to have her. I just think that we don't, as 18 a commission, have a lot of input as a whole. And I think 19 that previously there was a process that allowed the 2.0 commission to be involved prior to the budget being sent to 21 the mayor and I think --22 CHAIR DE REGO: Right. 23 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: -- we need to revert back to 2.4 that. 25 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Yeah. And that was supposed

2.0

to be, from what I gather when I first got on, the creation of the TIG was supposed to be involved in that. Fortunately, we got invited to a lot of meetings -- well, at least those who made up the TIG, it was Mark and I, and I think it was like on short notice -- I mean, I thought it was on short notice. We received indications of when each department, each unit was meeting, and I was able to attend a couple of those. But, yeah, in terms of a flow of information to the commission so we can make an adequate sense of input, maybe the TIG process is not the best. Maybe regular reports as they're creating the budget should come to the commission, you know, as they do it and then a final review. I'm not quite sure how we want to organize this, but, yeah, I think the process could be better so there's a more adequate flow of information.

VICE CHAIR PATNODE: This is Bobbie. Yes. And I'm just thinking that I'm okay if you want to disband the budget TIG at this point, but I was just thinking it might be good to have just some final paperwork, some little report that says, Here's what we would propose the process look like next year.

Is that what you're asking, Vice Chair Patnode?

CHAIR DE REGO: Oh, okay. I see what you're saying. Yeah. Okay. I -- so I guess our -- okay. So do we need a TIG in order to make that recommendation or could we just do it at our next meeting and send it to -- because it's obvious that the deed is done, right, the budget's been submitted and

we could probably put it on our agenda next time to be able to send to the department, you know, what we'd like to see in terms of the process and maybe we'd have some time to think about that.

Any -- anybody else or would people like the TIG to stay, okay, and then maybe work out those recommendations?

That's up to the commission.

MR. MURAI: Chair.

2.0

2.4

CHAIR DE REGO: Corp. Counsel Murai.

MR. MURAI: Yeah, thank you, Mr. Chair. Yeah, you know, I -- as the commission knows, I'm pinch hitting for Jen Oana who wasn't available today, so I'm not up to speed as you folks are on the matters before the commission. I just want to remind folks now, the commission's charter duty is to review and approve the budget for, you know, transmittal to the mayor. And while the commission does have the right to be informed or, you know, to whatever degree it wishes be involved in the process, it's not your -- I don't think you folks want to have responsibility for creating the budget.

CHAIR DE REGO: No.

MR. MURAI: Again, the goal is to review and approve. And, you know, it sounds like we missed the boat as far as timing of this matter. I don't believe there's any harm in the commission -- if the commission wishes, the commission can indicate its approval of the budget, you know,

even though it's already been transmitted, if you wish. That may be better than -- you've heard Melissa's presentation and if you don't have any problem with the budget that was transmitted, I don't believe that there's any harm in the commission deciding to approve it as well.

2.0

With regard to the TIG, it sounds to me as if the purpose of the TIG has become moot and if the TIG has not made any recommendation, I would say that it would be appropriate, if the commission wishes, to go ahead and just simply dissolve the TIG by motion today, if that's what the commission wants to do. What the commission wants to do as far as future or for next fiscal year, that's certainly something that you can work with the MPD administration on. I don't think that -- you know, if you want to do that by way of a motion, that's fine. If not, I don't -- you know, in my opinion, it's not necessary. You can simply indicate your desire for the degree to which you want to be involved for the next go-around, next go-around.

CHAIR DE REGO: So we -- Commissioner Redeker.

COMMISSIONER REDEKER: So I would make a motion to dissolve the TIG and part of that motion would be to also send a letter to the county to indicate that we have reviewed the budget and we concur with the budget that they -- that they reviewed. In my last two years on this commission and in prior commission that I was on, we always had the chairman,

1 the vice chairman, and as many of the commissioners as 2 possible sign that letter and send it through. So we 3 obviously didn't get a chance to do that, it's already gone. 4 So my motion is two-fold, dissolve the TIG and to send a 5 letter to the county. 6 CHAIR DE REGO: Do I hear a second on that? 7 MR. MURAI: Mr. Chair. I'm sorry. 8 CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah. Yeah, go ahead. 9 MR. MURAI: You're calling for a second and I -- I'm 10 premature, so --11 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Do I hear a second on that 12 motion? 13 (No response.) 14 CHAIR DE REGO: Hearing none, the motion dies. 15 Okay. Corp. Counsel Murai. 16 MR. MURAI: Oh, actually, it's -- since there was no 17 second, it's moot, but I was just --18 CHAIR DE REGO: Moot, right. 19 MR. MURAI: -- gonna ask Commissioner Redeker to 2.0 confirm -- to clarify when he said send a letter to the 21 county, whether he meant the mayor's office in particular, 22 but -- so Mr. Chair, there's a -- since the motion to dissolve 23 the TIG and to send the letter indicating approval has failed, 24 maybe you can ask if any other -- if any commissioner has any 25 other motion or alternative motion.

CHAIR DE REGO: I was just about to ask that. 1 2 anybody have an alternative motion? Or maybe we should 3 separate these two issues. So, first of all, the disbandment 4 of the TIG. Go ahead, Vice Chair Patnode. 5 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Would it make sense to have one 6 more TIG meeting and discuss the final actions of the TIG? 7 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. And what would you suggest the TIG do as far as final actions? 'Cause the TIG right now 8 9 is Mark and I. 10 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Right. I would actually volunteer to join your TIG for a final meeting. I just feel 11 12 like we need to have a clear statement of the process for 13 doing the review and approval of the budget prior to sending 14 it to the mayor. 15 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So, Corp. Counsel Murai, I think we have to vote in order to another -- add another 16 17 person to the TIG; correct? 18 MR. MURAI: Yeah, that's true. Normally the members 19 are appointed when the TIG is created. 20 CHAIR DE REGO: Right. So it seems to me we would need a motion to add --21 22 MR. MURAI: I'm not sure whether that's a --23 whether, you know, modifying the TIG's purpose or adding 2.4 members is appropriate when it's -- when that's not -- give me 25 a second. Let me take a look at the agenda again and see

exactly how it's worded.

2.4

VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I just want to add, Gary, Jen did tell us at our last meeting that it is okay to add members to a TIG after it's started.

MR. MURAI: Okay. Well, you know, I'll defer to Jen on that, but -- so just to clarify, Bobbie, what you'd like the TIG to do is to, I guess, for next year develop some kind of a process that would include the commission? Am I understanding correctly?

VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Well, we -- there used to be a process that included the commission and I think we've gone away from it in the last couple of years, so I think it would be helpful if we documented that process for the future years. I don't think we're trying to create anything brand new, I just want it clarified for the whole commission so we know what -- and the department, so we know what's supposed to be happening.

MR. MURAI: Okay. Mr. Chair, here's what I'd suggest, and it's up to you whether you want to adopt this or not. Why don't you put this matter on the agenda for the next meeting and if you think that the TIG can come up -- can meet and come up with its recommendation at the next meeting, then we can calendar this matter for the TIG's final report at their next meeting, at which point the TIG can present its recommendations and then the TIG can be disbanded and those

recommendations be discussed and voted on at the following meeting. So TIG report, possible dissolution in December, voting on the TIG's recommendations January.

2.0

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Does that sound acceptable?

But now what about adding a member to the TIG, we'd have to do

that now; correct?

MR. MURAI: Yeah. Well, like I said, I -- you know, I'll -- I'll defer to Jen. If Jen advised the commission that we can add additional member on today, that's fine, I -- you know, I think we can do that. I don't believe we need a vote on it.

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Okay. So, Bobbie, you're on. (Laughter.) Okay. Good.

So is everybody clear on that process? Then we'll work on recommendations and present that at the next meeting from the TIG, we'll dissolve the TIG at that time, and then vote on those recommendations in January. Okay.

So in terms of communicating anything about this particular budget, what's the -- at least from the commission of this year's budget, do you feel a need -- there is a need to or there's no need to at this particular point? There was a suggestion we send a letter. Anybody have an opinion on that just to kind of close off the conversation? The vote was no for the two together, I'm trying to separate them and try to figure out what the pleasure of the commission is in

regards to communicating about the budget. Anybody?

2.0

COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: Yeah, Chair, if I may, I just have a question. So I'm just kind of curious trying to follow all of this, but -- so it's been submitted already, how do we go back and -- and try to, you know, reinsert the process by having an opportunity to review it as Bobbie so spoke about earlier? I mean, it seemed like it's already done and, yeah, we didn't perhaps really have an opportunity, so how do we undo it?

CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah.

COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: What would be the process for that? I mean --

CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah. Well, today was supposed to be somewhat of a review. This is the first report we've had on the budget. But from what you've seen, I guess the suggestion was from Commissioner Redeker that we, you know, at least approve based on this review what we've heard and go along with that. So if that's not the pleasure of the commission, we don't need to carry this on further and then we'll work toward next year in terms of getting on -- on target with our process. So if I'm not gonna hear any other motion in regards to this issue, we just can move on.

COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: I mean, and I don't have a dispute -- like I say, you know, Melissa does a good job at presenting the budget, but for the benefit of the commission,

2.0

like I said, who is tasked with having to review the budget prior to submittal, you know, that's usually our kuleana and we didn't have a chance, but -- and like -- agreed, Mark, I mean, you know, I guess we can move forward on it, but just to have had the opportunity to go through it and review it and then later on have the opportunity to dissect it and say maybe we don't need this or we don't need that and, you know, just to have an opportunity. But now that it's -- already have been submitted, I guess with Melissa's explanation, if everybody's all good with it, I guess we can move forward, yeah.

CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So are you suggesting we send something or not? That's, I guess, what I'm asking.

COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: No.

CHAIR DE REGO: No. Okay. That's -- okay. So we're just going to leave that go, then. So why don't we just move on. Okay.

There's the creation of a TIG for the chief's evaluation, so far we only have Mark on that. I -- we have not actually established the TIG and its scope at this particular point, so we need to do that today if we're gonna be on schedule to be able to deliver our recommendations as we did last year by February. And as we know, when we establish a TIG, a TIG has to work out its recommendations, it brings it back to another -- the next meeting of the commission, right,

| for us would be December, okay, if we establish the TIG today, |
|--|
| and then after that, we would vote on its recommendations,     |
| which means there's a whole bunch of work that has to happen   |
| in between. Commissioner Redeker is always already on there,   |
| he was on the evaluation committee, he has experience in this  |
| area. I am willing to join the evaluation committee if we can  |
| establish the TIG today and maybe get somebody else, if we     |
| can. But there's a few things I think already that we can do.  |
| There are past documents from the evaluation last year that we |
| can use, we could ask people to think about recommendations    |
| for other stakeholders that we could send it out. I know that  |
| there are other kinds of things that we could do to improve    |
| the evaluation, as has been suggested by Commissioner Redeker. |
| So I think if we can establish the TIG today and its scope,    |
| then we'll be well on our way to get that done on time. So do  |
| I hear a motion  |
|  |

COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: (Inaudible) that you need for the TIG?

CHAIR DE REGO: Pardon? I would say at least two, which would be Commissioner Redeker and I, but I would prefer another person on this just to kind of spread the -- the kuleana around, you know what I mean, you know. So I think last year there were like three or four people on the TIG, so --

COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: I think I -- at the last

meeting -- at the last meeting, I think I volunteered to 1 2 assist --3 CHAIR DE REGO: Oh, okay. 4 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: -- there as well. 5 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So do I hear -- okay. 6 now, Corp. Counsel Murai, would it be enough to say -- to 7 establish the scope of the TIG would be to evaluate the chief 8 based on its charter mandate and that would be the scope of 9 the TIG? 10 MR. MURAI: Yeah, that's sufficient. CHAIR DE REGO: That's sufficient. Okay. 11 12 MR. MURAI: Yes. 13 CHAIR DE REGO: So do I hear a motion to set up a TIG made up of Commissioner Santiago, Commissioner Redeker, 14 15 and Commissioner De Rego to evaluate the chief and the scope of the -- the work of -- would be the chief's evaluation. 16 Okay. Vice Chair Patnode. 17 18 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I would like to --19 CHAIR DE REGO: So can you make -- go ahead. 2.0 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I would like to join the TIG 21 also and maybe we should ask if there are other commission 22 members who are interested. 23 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 2.4 MR. MURAI: The maximum is -- would be four. 25 I understand. I understand VICE CHAIR PATNODE:

1 that, Gary, we know how many can be in a TIG. I just want to 2 find out if there are other people who are interested so 3 perhaps I wouldn't join if there were other people who felt a 4 really strong desire to do it. 5 Is there anybody else? CHAIR DE REGO: I'd like to 6 remind that we've had some joy in trying to establish this TIG 7 for the last four months, so that's good that we got four 8 I think -- so do I hear a motion to establish the people on. 9 TIG with those four members? 10 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: So moved. 11 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: (Gesturing.) 12 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Vice Chair Patnode. 13 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I move we establish a TIG to review the performance of the chief, which will include Chair 14 15 De Rego, Mark Redeker, Eugene Santiago, and Bobbie Patnode. CHAIR DE REGO: Do I hear a second? 16 17 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: I second. COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: 18 (Gesturing.) CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 19 Commissioner Kuwahara, okay, 2.0 seconds the motion. I second the motion. 21 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: 22 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Okay. Let's go down the 23 list. Commissioner Santiago. 2.4 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: 25 Commissioner Redeker. CHAIR DE REGO: Okay.

| 1  | COMMISSIONER REDEKER: Aye.                                    |
|----|---|
| 2  | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Leach.                            |
| 3  | COMMISSIONER LEACH: Aye.                                      |
| 4  | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Patnode.                          |
| 5  | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Aye.                                      |
| 6  | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Kuwahara.                         |
| 7  | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: Gesturing.                             |
| 8  | CHAIR DE REGO: Aye. Okay. Good. So and I                      |
| 9  | I'll put my vote in there, aye. So, okay, so we have a TIG    |
| 10 | and they're right now we should, I guess, set up a time to    |
| 11 | meet later outside of here, the four of us, in order to set a |
| 12 | schedule so we have time to make recommendations at the       |
| 13 | December meeting. Okay.                                       |
| 14 | Okay. Good. So let's got those two done. Okay.                |
| 15 | So I'm going to need a motion for to us move into executive   |
| 16 | session.  |
| 17 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: (Gesturing.)                           |
| 18 | CHAIR DE REGO: Can you make it verbally, Janet?               |
| 19 | It's gotta be on the record.                                  |
| 20 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: I make a motion that we go             |
|    |   |
| 21 | into executive session.                                       |
| 21 | into executive session.  CHAIR DE REGO: Do I hear a second?   |
|    |   |
| 22 | CHAIR DE REGO: Do I hear a second?                            |

we received we got another link, so we'll see you in a few 1 2 minutes. Okay. 3 MR. MURAI: Mr. Chair, before -- before we go --4 CHAIR DE REGO: Yes. 5 MR. MURAI: -- I just want to say real quickly, 6 clarify that motion to go into executive session was for the 7 purposes to discuss the matters on the agenda relating to 8 matters such as internal investigations, requests for legal 9 representation, and other matters that are confidential by --10 by law. 11 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 12 MR. MURAI: You have to state the reason. 13 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 14 MR. MURAI: In open session we need to state the 15 reason for going into executive session. 16 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 17 MR. MURAI: So with -- thank you. 18 Okay. With that addition. CHAIR DE REGO: 19 So do we need to revote again, is that it? 2.0 MR. MURAI: No, no, no. Just --21 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 22 MR. MURAI: That's fine. 23 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 2.4 MR. MURAI: So we're all going to exit the public 25 session and members will be logging into the executive session

November 18, 2020 47

| 1  | link.  |
|----|--|
| 2  | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Thank you.                                |
| 3  | (Pause in Proceedings: 3:05 p.m4:06 p.m.)                      |
| 4  | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. It's November 18th and it's               |
| 5  | 4:06 p.m. at we're returning to regular session. I'd like      |
| 6  | to entertain a motion from someone to ratify all actions taken |
| 7  | in executive session.  |
| 8  | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: (Gesturing.)                               |
| 9  | CHAIR DE REGO: Vice Chair Patnode.                             |
| 10 | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I make a motion that we ratify             |
| 11 | all actions taken in executive session.                        |
| 12 | CHAIR DE REGO: Do I hear a second?                             |
| 13 | COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: Commissioner Santiago. I                |
| 14 | second the motion. I was waiting for Janet.                    |
| 15 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay.   |
| 16 | (Laughter.)  |
| 17 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: I was a waiting for somebody            |
| 18 | else.  |
| 19 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So we'll do the roll call.                |
| 20 | Vice Chair Patnode.  |
| 21 | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Aye.                                       |
| 22 | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Kuwahara.                          |
| 23 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: Aye.                                    |
| 24 | CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Leach.                             |
| 25 | COMMISSIONER LEACH: Aye.                                       |

CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Santiago. 1 2 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: Aye. 3 CHAIR DE REGO: And I also vote aye, so the motion 4 passed. Okay. So --Mr. Chair, we should probably note for 5 MR. MURAI: the record that Commissioner Redeker had to leave us, so --6 7 CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. 8 Anyway, but we still have a quorum. MR. MURAI: 9 Commissioner Redeker had to CHAIR DE REGO: Yes. 10 leave on a trip or -- so -- but we still have quorum. 11 please send in our -- any agenda items that you have or 12 concerns. 13 COMMISSIONER PATNODE: (Gesturing.) 14 CHAIR DE REGO: Yes, Commissioner Patnode. 15 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: I just wanted to ask a question 16 about whether we've heard anything about adding a member to the commission. 17 I have not heard anything. 18 CHAIR DE REGO: 19 Amy, do you know where that process is at currently? MS. LAU: No, I don't. 2.0 21 CHAIR DE REGO: So what's the process in terms of --22 so Commissioner Dixon or Chair Dixon resigned, I would imagine 23 we've informed the mayor's office and I would imagine 2.4 whoever's in charge of making appointments or dealing with 25 appointments to boards and commissions, it's in their hands at

| 1  | this point. Is it a possibility to find out where that        |
|----|---|
| 2  | process is currently and when it's gonna get before the       |
| 3  | government, you know, relations and transparency committee?   |
| 4  | MS. LAU: I can try. I don't usually reach out to              |
| 5  | them, they always just send me the packet for whoever the new |
| 6  | commissioner is gonna be.                                     |
| 7  | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. I could always ask. I'm not              |
| 8  | shy. So, yeah, okay. But I could do that. I know a lot of     |
| 9  | people up there, so as we all do.                             |
| 10 | Okay. So the next meeting of the Maui Police                  |
| 11 | Commission is scheduled for December 16th, 2020, at 2:00 p.m. |
| 12 | So do I hear a motion to adjourn? Last time I did             |
| 13 | it without objection, but I'm getting sense from              |
| 14 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: (Gesturing.)                           |
| 15 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. So, Janet, do you want to                |
| 16 | make the motion?  |
| 17 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: I make it (inaudible) I                |
| 18 | might as well go for all.                                     |
| 19 | CHAIR DE REGO: Go for it.                                     |
| 20 | COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: I'll make a motion to                  |
| 21 | adjourn the meeting.  |
| 22 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Do I have a second?                      |
| 23 | VICE CHAIR PATNODE: (Gesturing.)                              |
| 24 | CHAIR DE REGO: Okay. Who are you pointing to?                 |
| 25 | (Laughter.)   |

VICE CHAIR PATNODE: You can't tell, can you? 1 2 pointing at Gene, but I go -- I'll second it. This is Bobbie. CHAIR DE REGO: Vice Chair Patnode seconds the 3 4 Oh, my God and it's still light outside. And so motion. 5 we'll do the roll call again. Okay. Vice Chair Patnode. 6 VICE CHAIR PATNODE: Aye. 7 CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Kuwahara. 8 COMMISSIONER KUWAHARA: 9 CHAIR DE REGO: Commissioner Leach. 10 COMMISSIONER LEACH: Aye with a comment. Good job. Good job, Chair Frank. 11 CHAIR DE REGO: Oh, thank you. Thank you. 12 Yeah. 13 was a disheveled today, but -- sorry about that. There was --14 I had a work emergency right before I got on this call, so, 15 yeah, I had to take care of that before I got here, so I --16 you know, but thank you very much for the -- the support. And then last, but not least, Commissioner Santiago. 17 18 COMMISSIONER SANTIAGO: You're ready for my vote? 19 Okay. Aye. 20 CHAIR DE REGO: Yeah. Yeah. Please, yes. And I 21 will also say aye, which makes it a majority. So thanks so 22 much, guys, really appreciate all your work. 23 (The proceedings were adjourned at 4:10 p.m.) 24 25

| 1  | <u>CERTIFICATE</u>   |
|----|--|
| 2  | STATE OF HAWAII )  |
| 3  | ) SS.<br>COUNTY OF MAUI )                                      |
| 4  |  |
| 5  | I, Sandra J. Gran, Certified Shorthand Reporter for            |
| 6  | the State of Hawaii, hereby certify that on November 18, 2020, |
| 7  | at 2:04 p.m., the proceedings was taken down by me in machine  |
| 8  | shorthand and was thereafter reduced to typewritten form under |
| 9  | my supervision; that the foregoing represents, to the best of  |
| 10 | my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings   |
| 11 | had in the foregoing matter.                                   |
| 12 |  |
| 13 | I further certify that I am not an attorney for any            |
| 14 | of the parties hereto, nor in any way concerned with the       |
| 15 | cause.   |
| 16 |  |
| 17 | DATED this 29th day of November, 2020, in Maui,                |
| 18 | Hawaii.  |
| 19 |  |
| 20 |  |
| 21 |  |
| 22 | Janara D. Ora  |
| 23 | Sandra J. Gran, RPR<br>Hawaii CSR 424                          |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |